City	Of	York	Council
------	----	------	---------

Committee Minutes

Meeting Corporate and Scrutiny Management Policy

and Scrutiny Committee

Date 6 March 2017

Present Councillors Williams (Chair), Galvin (Vice-

Chair), Crisp, D'Agorne, Fenton, Gates, Levene, Reid and Steward (Substitute -

Conservative Vacancy)

Part A - Matters Dealt With Under Delegated Powers

46. Declarations of Interest

Members were asked to declare any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests, any prejudicial interests or any disclosable pecuniary interests which they might have in respect of business on the agenda. None were declared.

47. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the Corporate and Scrutiny

Management Policy and Scrutiny Committee meeting held on 13 February 2017 and the CSMC

Call-in meeting held on 31 January 2017 be

approved as a correct record and then signed by the

Chair.

48. Public Participation

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

49. Report on Terms of Reference for Proposed New Scrutiny Committees

[See also Part B minute]

Members gave consideration to a report which proposed terms of reference for the new scrutiny committees to be considered by Council in March 2017. Included in the report were the following proposals for the Committee's consideration, which it was hoped would improve future work planning:

- Invite the Leader and/or Deputy Leader to attend at the beginning of each municipal year (early June), to advise on key priorities for the Council for the year ahead. This would enable CSMC to feed potential areas for scrutiny involvement into scrutiny committee work planning discussions
- 2. Advise on and sign off each scrutiny committee's annual workplan(late July)
- 3. Receive regular updates from the new scrutiny committees on progress with their workplans through regular meetings with the Chairs of the new scrutiny committees (November & May)

Officers clarified that the proposals were aiming to improve scrutiny work planning, and that the attendance of the Leader and Deputy leader did not preclude scrutiny committees from inviting Executive Members to meetings as required. However, this change would allow CSMC to move forward in its management role.

During debate Members highlighted the importance of retaining the ability to call Executive Members to meetings as necessary and raised ongoing concerns about the process of pre-decision scrutiny, in particular timescales and Officer engagement. In light of these concerns and wider cultural engagement issues discussed as part of the recent scrutiny review work, Members felt that a discussion with the Chief Executive at a future meeting would be helpful.

Resolved: That;

- the Leader and/or Deputy Leader be invited to attend at the beginning of each municipal year (early June), to advise on key Council priorities for the year ahead.
- the Chief Executive be invited to the next CSMC meeting to discuss the pre-decision scrutiny process.

Reason: To enable the scrutiny management role of this Committee to be fulfilled.

50. Work Plan 2016-17 (Including Verbal Update on One Planet York Scrutiny Review)

Members were asked to give consideration to the committee's Work Plan for 2016/17.

Councillor D'Agorne, Chair of the One Planet York Scrutiny Review Task Group, gave a verbal update on the One Planet York Scrutiny Review.

Resolved: That the committee's work plan for 2016/17 be approved subject to the following additions:

 Further to Minute No. 49 above, facilitating the Chief Executive to attend a future meeting (June if possible) to discuss engagement with scrutiny in general, but including officer support for predecision scrutiny.

Reason: To ensure that the committee has a planned programme of work in place.

Part B - Matters Referred To Council

51. Report on Terms of Reference for Proposed New Scrutiny Committees

[See also Part A minute]

Members gave consideration to a report which proposed terms of reference for the new scrutiny committees to be considered by Council in March 2017. The Committee were asked to consider the draft terms of reference and agree a recommendation to Council.

Officers gave a brief background to the report and referred Members to an alternative split for the Economy & Place Directorate proposed by the Corporate Director of Economy & Place for the Committee's consideration (agenda Pg. 14).

During debate some Members felt that this proposed split would be a good trial for alternative ways of working in scrutiny, conversely some disagreed as the Committee decided against this at the last meeting in favour of splits by Directorate. However, there was agreement that splitting the Economy & Place functions across two committees by whichever method may prove problematic.

Councillor Levene moved in favour of the proposed alternative split, with Councillor D'Agorne seconding. When put to the vote this motion fell.

As an alternative, it was then moved that the Economy and Place Directorate be dealt with via one standing scrutiny committee.

Recommended: That Members agree to recommend to Council the proposed Terms of Reference for the new scrutiny committees set out in Annex A to the report, subject to Economy and Place being dealt with via one standing scrutiny committee rather than two.

Reason: To enable the changes required to the scrutiny function to be presented to Full Council in March 2017 for approval.

Councillor D Williams, Chair [The meeting started at 6.30 pm and finished at 7.20 pm].